

March 29, 2018

By USPS Mail & Email

Shannon G. Hardin, Council President
City of Columbus, Ohio
Columbus City Hall
90 West Broad Street
Columbus, Ohio 43215
SGHardin@columbus.gov

Dear Mr. Hardin:

We are in receipt of your letter, dated February 13, 2018, which references letters that we, the NAACP Legal Defense & Educational Fund, Inc. (LDF) wrote, dated November 17, 2017 and December 15, 2017, to the former President of Columbus's City Council, Zach Klein, who now serves as the City's Attorney.¹ Our letters, written on behalf of the Everyday People for Positive Change (EDP), raise sincere and unabated concerns about whether the at-large electoral method for members of Columbus's seven-member City Council violates Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act (Section 2) and other laws.

Your February 13 letter indicates that the City Council has "objective data" that the current system of electing Columbus's councilmembers complies with Section 2. On behalf of EDP, we request the data upon which the Council relies to support that assertion.

Moreover, your letter contends that a majority of Columbus's voters, including those who reside in majority-minority areas of the City, "are satisfied" with the existing system based on the election results of several unsuccessful ballot initiatives that would have established district-based voting for the City Council. Our understanding is that district-based voting in previous years was in fact supported in East Side (an area of Columbus with a high concentration of residents who are racial minorities).² As we acknowledged in our November 2017 letter, that issue was ultimately unsuccessful in a low turnout 2016 election in the face of opposition by City Hall and developers and other businesses that made substantial financial contributions to defeating the initiative.³ We also request the data that supports the Council's assessment on this point.

¹ This correspondence between LDF and the City Council can be found at <http://www.naacpldf.org/press-release/ldf-sends-letter-columbus-city-council-over-large-electoral-method>.

² Michael F. Curtin, *City's past includes century of at-large council members*, Columbus Dispatch (July 17, 2016).

³ See also Lucas Sullivan, *Follow the money flowing to ward initiative campaigns in Columbus*, Columbus Dispatch (July 22, 2016), http://www.dispatch.com/content/stories/local/2016/07/22/Follow_the_money_in_the_issue_1_campaign.html (reporting that "Columbus-area developers and business titans are lining up heavily against Issue 1 [a 2016 ballot proposal to change the Council from seven at-large members to 13 members with 10 elected from districts/wards

For your reference, **appended** to this letter is a chart that identifies the councilmembers who have served on this important local governing body for approximately two decades. As it shows and we previously highlighted in our initial November 2017 letter, all of the Black councilmembers, with Jeanette Bradley being elected in 1991 as the lone exception, were initially appointed to the Council after an application process and selection by the existing councilmembers. We continue to have serious concerns that an at-large system in which *every* Black councilmember for decades has been elected as an incumbent only *after* an initial appointment by the Council denies Black voters of the equality opportunity to elect their preferred candidates to the Council as Section 2 requires.

I recently had the opportunity to meet with over two dozen Columbus residents across the City—from The Thursday Club; at a forum at the OSU African and African American Studies Community Extension Center; at the Lincoln Café; in a Somali-American community center; at a charter school; and in individual meetings—almost all of whom take umbrage at the appointment process that this City Council employs routinely rather than as an exception.⁴ Almost everyone with whom I spoke referenced the recent campaign of Jasmine Ayres, a Black woman who was a novice candidate for the City Council in the 2017 election and ran on a campaign that spoke to the concerns of working-class families and communities of color.⁵ Ms. Ayres received approximately 31,000 votes, coming in as the first runner-up behind three incumbent councilmembers who won the election: you, Mr. Hardin, as well as Priscilla Tyson, and Mitchell Brown.⁶ Ms. Ayres thereafter applied for the vacancy created by former Council President Klein’s election as City Attorney.⁷ Though a finalist for the appointment, the Council did not appoint her.⁸ Indeed, despite Ms. Ayres’s demonstrated and substantial support from Columbus’s voters, the Council appointed Emmanuel Remy.⁹ This outcome is emblematic of residents’ deep concern that “people who make the rules don’t live our lives.”¹⁰ A concern with the lack of transparency around the Council’s

and three at-large], giving the anti-ward campaign a 3-to-1 financial advantage over the group trying to change the Columbus City Council.”)

⁴ Indeed, in 2017, Michael Stinziano and Elizabeth Brown, two white candidates were the first councilmembers to be elected *without* an initial appointment since 1997—20 years ago.

⁵ Ayres for Columbus City Council ’17, <https://ayresforcolumbus.com/>

⁶ Scott Anderson, *Columbus Election Results: City Council, City Attorney*, Columbus Patch (Nov. 7, 2017), <https://patch.com/ohio/columbus/columbus-election-results-city-council-city-attorney>; Zaid Jilani, *et al.*, *A Year After Trump, Democrats, Socialists, and Populists Sweep Elections*, The Intercept (Nov. 9, 2017), <https://theintercept.com/2017/11/08/a-year-after-trump-democrats-socialists-and-populists-sweep-elections/>.

⁷ Dave Ghose, *Politics: Why Can’t Zach Klein Stand Still?* Columbus Monthly (Apr. 12, 2017), <http://www.columbusmonthly.com/lifestyle/20170407/politics-why-cant-zach-klein-stand-still>.

⁸ Rick Rouan, *Columbus City Council identifies finalists for open seat*, Columbus Dispatch (Dec. 28, 2018), <http://www.dispatch.com/news/20171227/columbus-city-council-identifies-finalists-for-open-seat>.

⁹ Steve Brown, *Columbus Council Chooses Realtor Over Activist to Fill Vacancy*, WOSU Public Media (Jan. 9, 2018), <http://radio.wosu.org/post/columbus-council-chooses-realtor-over-activist-fill-vacancy#stream/0>.

¹⁰ Moreover, Columbus residents with whom I spoke also complain of the typical pipeline from which councilmembers often derive. Indeed, four of the seven current councilmembers were former city employees. Lauren Sega, *Who’s that Candidate? Mitchell Brown, Columbus City Council*, Columbus Underground (Oct. 20, 2017), <https://www.columbusunderground.com/whos-that-candidate-mitchell-brown-columbus-city-council-ls1>; *Member Spotlight: Shannon Hardin Joins Columbus City Council*, Franklin County Young

appointment process and specifically that “Columbus is a large and diverse city whose city council lacks local representation from all areas of the city,” also was a refrain brought to the attention of the Council through the Charter Review Commission.¹¹

The chart also reflects that a significant number of councilmembers choose *not* to serve their full terms. For example, Michael Stinziano, started his term on the Council in 2016 and, two years into it, in January 2018, announced his intention to run for County Auditor in the May 2, 2018 election.¹² Jaiza Page, appointed in January 2015 and then elected in November 2015 as an incumbent, is now running for Judge in the Court of Common Pleas with two years remaining in her term.¹³ Zach Klein sought three different political seats in three years as a councilmember.¹⁴ This begs the question of what form of representation Columbus’s residents generally and Black residents specifically are receiving since councilmembers seemingly view their time on the Council as a stepping stone to their next endeavor.

Democrats (Dec. 2, 2014), <https://franklincountyyoungdemocrats.com/2014/12/02/member-spotlight-shannon-hardin-joins-columbus-city-council/>; Jaiza N. Page, The City of Columbus City Council, Columbus.gov, <https://www.columbus.gov/page/>; Lauren Sega, *Council President Pro Tem Michael Stinziano Announces Run for County Auditor*, Columbus Underground (Jan. 16, 2018), <https://www.columbusunderground.com/council-president-pro-tem-announces-run-for-county-auditor-ls1>.

¹¹ See, e.g., Stefanie L. Coe, *To the Members of Council and Mayor Ginther*, 2016 Charter Review Committee final report at 195-96, https://www.columbus.gov/uploadedFiles/Columbus/Elected_Officials/City_Council/Charter_Review_Commission/2016_Committee/2016%20Charter%20Review%20Committee%20final%20report.pdf [hereinafter Charter Review Committee final report] (explaining the Council’s process for appointments and reporting testimony by a member of the Charter Review Committee that the “process is not transparent at this point; interviews are done privately, not in open meetings”); see also *id.* at 142-43; *id.* at 183 (reporting testimony from a Charter Review Committee Member recommending that the Council “pay attention to [] complaints about the lack of familiarity with sections of the city” because residents “didn’t feel like anyone was responsible to their neighborhood, they didn’t have anybody who was their person to go to.”); *id.* at 185 (reporting testimony from a Charter Review Committee Member that “one of the things that rang true for her within this [Review] process is that there is a little dissatisfaction within the community and feeling like they have not been heard. She stated that they heard that repeatedly and throughout public commentary...” and “questioned if there was a way that we structure council so that we can be more responsive to people”); *id.* at 225 (reporting testimony from the Chair of the Commission that “in some parts of the city, there aren’t members of Council that have been from those parts of the city for at least as long as she can remember and she stated that creates a significant challenge in and of itself”).

¹² Lauren Sega, *Council President Pro Tem Michael Stinziano Announces Run for County Auditor*, Columbus Underground (Jan. 16, 2018), <https://www.columbusunderground.com/council-president-pro-tem-announces-run-for-county-auditor-ls1>.

¹³ Rick Rouan, *Councilwoman Jaiza Page starts a run for judge*, Columbus Dispatch (Dec. 18, 2017), <http://www.dispatch.com/news/20171218/councilwoman-jaiza-page-starts-run-for-judge>.

¹⁴ Dave Ghose, *Politics: Why Can’t Zach Klein Stand Still?*, Columbus Monthly (Apr. 12, 2017), <http://www.columbusmonthly.com/lifestyle/20170407/politics-why-cant-zach-klein-stand-still> (reporting that “[a]fter voters re-elected him to city council in 2015, Klein waited just a month before launching a bid to unseat Franklin County Prosecutor Ron O’Brien,” then “[in 2016], Klein lost that hard-fought election, the most expensive countywide race in Franklin County history”; “[b]ut rather than regroup and return to city council, the Democrat again waited just a month to announce plans to seek another new office in 2017—Columbus city attorney.”)

Indeed, in the context of this transiency of members on the Council, various of your constituents with whom I spoke also raised concerns about the Councilmembers' lack of responsiveness to their needs and concerns under the current system. Black residents complain that officials are rarely present in their communities¹⁵ and are difficult to contact to raise concerns, which they perceive is because officials know that they do not need the votes of minority residents under the existing at-large structure. As an example, residents expressed that incumbent candidates did not even show up at the October 29, 2017 NAACP candidate screening forum or the November 2, 2017 Linden forum because of their belief that "they don't need us" under the current system. Residents explained that it is easier to contact their state senators than any of the seven at-large elected city councilmembers. In combination with the councilmembers who leave before their respective terms of office are complete, a member of the Charter Review Committee remarked: "You can call and get the person who is most responsive and sometimes you do build relationships and they leave Council and then you have to start all over again with someone else."¹⁶

As a practical matter too, not only do residents complain that councilmembers are rarely in the Black community, they also complain that Council meetings are not transparent or structured to increase the participation of community members, particularly low-income community members. Council meetings, which start at 5:00 p.m. on Monday evenings, are not televised on a public access station, and residents must wait until the end of the meetings to comment on issues that are not on the agenda; they have three minutes to do so.¹⁷

Residents also complain of the lack of a responsiveness by the Council to longstanding policy issues, including neighborhood safety concerns,¹⁸ specific demands to address the killing

¹⁵ Residents expressed that they have never seen a politician in their community and other residents complained that they never see the mayor and councilmembers in their community outside of an election season.

¹⁶ See *supra* note 11, Charter Review Committee final report at 188.

¹⁷ Columbus City Council, *Frequently Asked Questions*, Columbus.gov, <https://www.columbus.gov/council/How-Do-I/Frequently-Asked-Questions/>; Columbus City Council, *How-Do-I-Attend a City Council Meeting*, Columbus.gov, <https://www.columbus.gov/council/How-Do-I/Watch-or-Attend-a-Council-Meeting/>; Columbus City Council, *Rules for Speaking at Columbus City Council*, Columbus.gov, <https://www.columbus.gov/Templates/Detail.aspx?id=65065>.

¹⁸ Doug Caruso, *Neighborhood groups say council ignores anti-crime plan*, Columbus Dispatch (Oct. 18, 2011) <http://www.dispatch.com/content/stories/local/2011/10/18/neighborhood-groups-say-council-ignores-anti-crime-plan.html> (reporting that "[l]eaders of the Columbus Compact, the Olde Towne East Block Watch and other groups say they have been trying to get the council to commit since fall 2011 to laws that would [help fight drugs and violence in their Near East Side and South Side neighborhoods]").

of Black people by Columbus's police¹⁹ and other police misconduct,²⁰ housing instability,²¹ income inequality, high infant mortality, and preservation of historic housing.²² Residents are incredulous that councilmembers are not speaking publicly about the killings of Black people in Columbus at the hands of police. After organizers held three disruptions of Council meetings from September 2016 to September 2017 due to the Council's lack of responsiveness to residents' concerns over a series of suspicious deaths and one video-recorded beating of Black men, our understanding is that former Council President Klein began to read at the beginning of each City Council meeting starting in October 2017 provisions of the City Code regarding the disturbance of lawful meetings and criminal trespass.²³ You, President Hardin, have continued the practice.

Residents also complain of the Council's failure to facilitate development in Black communities as compared to the development incentives (*e.g.*, tax abatements) that the Council provides which benefit areas where white residents live and patronize.²⁴ Moreover, even when

¹⁹ See, *e.g.*, Alli Maloney, *Henry Green, The Columbus Police, and the Jumpout Boys: How Racism Becomes Institutionalized in Police Departments*, Pacific Standard (Feb. 7, 2018) (reporting that between 2013 and 2017, 21 of 28 people killed by the Columbus police were Black), <https://psmag.com/social-justice/racism-institutionalized-cpd>; Theodore Decker, *Theodore Decker: Ginther's 'neighborhood conversations' are heavily managed events*, Columbus Dispatch (Feb. 22, 2018), <http://www.dispatch.com/news/20180222/theodore-decker-ginthers-neighborhood-conversations-are-heavily-managed-events> (reporting that at the mayor's "one-event speech in 2017 at the police academy, the mayor was met by 100 nontraditional protesters angered by recent shootings of citizens by police and officer tactics they allege were heavy-handed and counterproductive).

²⁰ See, *e.g.*, *Protesters of violent arrest disrupt city council*, Record Courier (Sept. 19, 2017), <http://www.record-courier.com/news/20170919/protesters-of-violent-arrest-disrupt-city-council-meeting> (reporting that more than 100 people protested a city council meeting after police repeatedly punched and kicked a man after his arrest and called for the firing of the officers and the police chief); Adora Namigadde, *Activists Demand More Accountability from Columbus City Council and Police*, WOSU Public Media (Sept. 18, 2017), <http://radio.wosu.org/post/activists-demand-more-accountability-columbus-city-council-and-police#stream/0> (reporting that People's Justice Project presented a list of demands to the City Council, including ending the use of plainclothes officers, firing Columbus Police Chief Kim Jacobs, demanding that Columbus Police officers undergo mandatory mental health, racial bias, and de-escalation trainings).

²¹ Rita Price, *Report: Racial disparity in homelessness not just a result of poverty*, Columbus Dispatch (Mar. 17, 2018), <http://www.dispatch.com/news/20180316/report-racial-disparity-in-homelessness-not-just-result-of-poverty> (reporting on research showing that "[i]n Franklin County, [B]lack[] [people] make up 22 percent of the general population and about 40 percent of people living in poverty, yet they represent 65 percent of those served in the homeless system"); see also Rita Price, *Why do Black families make up so much of central Ohio's homeless population*, Columbus Dispatch (Dec. 5, 2016), <http://www.dispatch.com/content/stories/local/2016/12/05/groups-to-study-racial-disparity-in-central-ohio-housing-needs.html>.

²² Indeed, our initial November 2017 letter referenced efforts to save a significant portion of Poindexter Village, the first public housing community in Ohio. See also Mark Ferenchik, *Facades, landmarks kept in storage sometimes are reborn* (June 17, 2017), <http://www.dispatch.com/news/20170617/facades-landmarks-kept-in-storage-sometimes-are-reborn>.

²³ Columbus City Council, *Rules for Speaking at Columbus City Council*, Columbus.gov, <https://www.columbus.gov/Templates/Detail.aspx?id=65065>.

²⁴ See, *e.g.*, Bill Bush, *Columbus schools left out of Easton tax-break deal*, Columbus Dispatch (Feb. 14, 2017), <http://www.dispatch.com/news/20170214/columbus-schools-left-out-of-easton-tax-break-deal> (reporting on the Council's call for a 100% tax abatement on new residential construction in and around Easton Town Center which, while saving Easton property owners—in a non-economically distressed area—potentially \$68 million over nearly 40 years in abated property taxes, redirects roughly \$46 million from Columbus City

residents overwhelmingly object to development proposals, councilmembers have approved them. For example, despite the public voting on five occasions against tax increases to fund a public arena, the City Council still unanimously voted to use the city's tax revenue to operate the arena.²⁵

To this end, we further request evidence (or for the Council to identify local sources thereof) reflecting the Council's responsiveness to the needs of the Black community over the last decade with respect to indicators of income, infant mortality, adult health, employment, housing, city construction and contracting, commercial business, community development, and police contact.

Finally, in our initial November 2017 letter, we acknowledged that the Council formed a committee last year to study the City's 104-year old electoral structural. The Council recommended maintaining the at-large voting system, although it proposed enlarging the size of the City Council to nine members and instituting a requirement that each member reside in a different ward. The Council tabled this issue in 2017, but recently decided by a vote of 5-2 to put that recommendation to the voters.²⁶ That issue, to be marked Issue 3 on the May 2018 Ballot, was voted upon by the Council on the deadline for primary ballot measures. As we previously mentioned, the proposed voting structure (*i.e.*, 9 members subject to a residency requirement but elected at-large) may create the perception that voters will have a representative chosen by a neighborhood community, but the maintenance of the at-large voting scheme for all members of the City Council will likely continue to diminish the voices of Black voters in Columbus.

To advance this critical conversation about Black political representation in Columbus, I welcome (1) receipt of the aforementioned evidence that the system for appointment and then electing councilmembers under the at-large structure ensures that Black voters have the equal opportunity to elect their preferred candidates, (2) evidence or local sources thereof reflecting the

Schools and does so, under state law, without notice and approval rights of the school board); *id.* (reporting that this tax abatement was brought about by a change in law that would have required Tax Increment Financing (TIF) money to be spent in the area of the properties that pay into the TIF account)

²⁵ See, e.g., Doug Caruso, *Council Oks deal to buy Nationwide Arena*, Columbus Dispatch (Oct. 4, 2011), <http://www.dispatch.com/content/stories/local/2011/10/04/council-oks-deal-to-buy-arena.html>; Doug Caruso, *Approval of arena deal expected tonight*, Columbus Dispatch (Oct. 3, 2011), <http://www.dispatch.com/content/stories/local/2011/10/03/approval-of-arena-deal-expected-tonight.html>.

²⁶ Rick Rouan, *Council, facing citizens lawsuit approves ballot issue to create representation by district*, Columbus Dispatch (Mar. 5, 2018), <http://www.dispatch.com/news/20180305/council-facing-citizens-lawsuit-approves-ballot-issue-to-create-representation-by-district>.

In providing one of the two votes against the proposal, Councilmember Stinziano reportedly expressed his support for the existing at-large voting method for the Council, as well as his belief that Columbus's residents are more concerned with the responsiveness of area commissions, established by the Council in the 1970s, as compared to the electoral structure of the City Council. *Id.*

From our perspective, un-elected area commissioners cannot be a substitute for compliance with Section 2 and the ability of Black voters to elect their preferred candidates to the City Council. The area commission positions simply are not the same as elected council representatives, including that while area commissioners may make recommendations to the council, they are non-binding. See Chapter 3109 – Area Commissions – Procedures for Establishment, Section 3109.14 – Functions and duties (A)(3), available at https://library.municode.com/oh/columbus/codes/code_of_ordinances?nodeId=TIT31PLHIPRCO_CH3109_ARCOPRES&searchText=#TOPTITLE

Council's responsiveness to the needs of the Black community over the past decade to the above-listed indicators of community wellness, and (3) thereafter, the opportunity to meet in person with members of the Council to discuss this evidence.

Sincerely,



Leah C. Aden
Senior Counsel
NAACP LEGAL DEFENSE
& EDUCATIONAL FUND, INC.
(212) 965-7715
laden@naacpldf.org

cc (via email):

Jonathan Beard, Treasurer, Everyday People for Positive Change,
jonbeard1964@gmail.com

Miriam R. B. Abbott, concerned citizen, mirmabbott@gmail.com

Michael Stinziano, Councilmember, mstinziano@columbus.gov

Elizabeth C. Brown, Councilmember, c/o Kelsey Ellingsen, Legislative Aide,
kaellingsen@columbus.gov

Mitchell J. Brown, Councilmember, c/o Denise Friend-Foster, Legislative Aide,
DFriendFoster@columbus.gov

Jaiza Page, Councilmember, c/o Ralonda Hampton, Legislative Aide,
rshampton@columbus.gov

Emmanuel V. Remy, Councilmember, c/o Jeffrey Carter, Legislative Aide,
jdcarter@columbus.gov

Priscilla R. Tyson, Councilmember, c/o Nicole Harper, Legislative Aide,
NNHarper@columbus.gov

Zach Klein, Columbus City Attorney, zmklein@columbus.gov

Hon. Andrew J. Ginther, Mayor, City of Columbus, ajginther@columbus.gov

Stephanie L. Coe, Chair, Charter Review Commission, stephaniecoe@hotmail.com

Nana Watson, President, Columbus Branch of the NAACP, nana_jones@sbcglobal.net

Rev. Joel L. King, Jr., Vice President, Columbus Branch of the NAACP,
kingjjr@aol.com

Appendix

	Race	Method of Initial Election / Appointment	Party Affiliation	Date Elected / Appointed	Date Departed	Method of Departure
Emmanuel Remyⁱ	White	Appointment	Democrat	Jan. 2018		
Mitchell Brownⁱⁱ	Black	Appointment	Democrat	Jan. 2016		
Michael Stinzianoⁱⁱⁱ	White	Election	Democrat	Jan. 2016		
Elizabeth Brown^{iv}	White	Election	Democrat	Jan. 2016		
Jaiza Page^v	Black	Appointment	Democrat	Jan. 2015		
Shannon Hardin^{vi}	Black	Appointment	Democrat	Oct. 2014		
Priscilla Tyson^{vii}	Black	Appointment	Democrat	Feb. 2007		
Fran Ryan ^{viii}	White	Appointment	Democrat	Sept. 2015	Jan. 2016	Term Expired ^{ix}
Michelle Mills ^x	Black	Appointment	Democrat	Jan. 2011	Aug. 2015	Resigned before term
Zachary Klein ^{xi}	White	Appointment	Democrat	Jan. 2011	Nov. 2017	Resigned before term
Eileen Paley ^{xii}	White	Appointment	Democrat	Jan. 2009	Dec. 2015	Resigned before term
A. Troy Miller ^{xiii}	Black	Appointment	Democrat	Jan. 2009	Aug. 2014	Resigned before term
Hearcel Craig ^{xiv}	Black	Appointment	Democrat	Apr. 2007	Dec. 2014	Resigned before term
Andrew Ginther ^{xv}	White	Appointment	Democrat	Feb. 2007	Dec. 2015	Term Expired
Mary Jo Hudson	White	Appointment	Democrat	Sept. 2004	Jan. 2007	Resigned before term
Patsy Thomas	White	Appointment	Democrat	2002	Mar. 2007	Resigned before term
Kevin Boyce ^{xvi}	Black	Appointment	Democrat	Sept. 2000	Dec. 2008	Resigned before term
Charleta Tavares	Black	Appointment	Democrat	1999	Dec. 2010	Resigned before term
Michael Mentel	White	Appointment	Democrat	Jan. 1999	Dec. 2010	Resigned before term
Maryellen	White	Election	Democrat	Nov. 1997	Dec. 2008	Resigned before term
Richard Sensenbrenner	White	Appointment	Democrat	Jun. 1996	Mar. 2007	Resigned before term
Matt Habash	White	Appointment	Democrat	1993	2006	Resigned before term
Michael Coleman	Black	Appointment	Democrat	1992	1999	Resigned before term
Jeanette Bradley	Black	Election	Republican	1991	2002	Resigned before term

*The names of the current councilmembers are **bolded**.*

Appendix

-
- ⁱ Clare Roth, *Columbus Council's Newest Appointed Member Doesn't Plan to Change System*, WOSU Public Media (Jan. 12, 2018), <http://radio.wosu.org/post/columbus-councils-newest-appointed-member-doesnt-plan-change-system#stream/0>.
- ⁱⁱ Lauren Saga, *Who's that Candidate? Mitchell Brown, Columbus City Council*, Columbus Underground (Oct. 20, 2017), <https://www.columbusunderground.com/whos-that-candidate-mitchell-brown-columbus-city-council-1s1>.
- ⁱⁱⁱ Michael Stinziano, Ballotpedia, https://ballotpedia.org/Michael_Stinziano.
- ^{iv} Elizabeth C. Brown, Columbus.gov, <https://www.columbus.gov/council/ebrown/>.
- ^v Jaiza N. Page, Columbus.gov, <https://www.columbus.gov/page/>.
- ^{vi} Lucas Sullivan, *Ex-Coleman aide Shannon Hardin appointed to City Council*, Columbus Dispatch (Oct. 7, 2014), <http://www.dispatch.com/article/20141006/NEWS/310069753>.
- ^{vii} Priscilla Tyson, Ballotpedia, https://ballotpedia.org/Priscilla_Tyson
- ^{viii} Gary Seman Jr., *Fran Ryan picked to replace Michelle Mills*, ThisWeek Community News (Sept. 29, 2015), <http://www.thisweeknews.com/article/20150928/NEWS/309289673>.
- ^{ix} Ryan served the remainder of Michelle Mills' term after Mills resigned. Elizabeth Brown filled the seat vacated by Ryan/Mills.
- ^x Rita Price, *Former councilwoman Michelle Mills to repay \$44,000 to charity she led*, Columbus Dispatch (Aug. 4, 2017), <http://www.dispatch.com/news/20170803/former-councilwoman-michelle-mills-to-repay-44000-to-charity-she-led>.
- ^{xi} *Columbus City Council adds 2 members*, Bizjournals.com (Jan. 13, 2011), <https://www.bizjournals.com/columbus/news/2011/01/11/columbus-city-council-adds-2-members.html>.
- ^{xii} Walker Evans, *Eileen Paley & Troy Miller Picked for City Council*, Columbus Underground (Jan. 13, 2009), <https://www.columbusunderground.com/eileen-paley-troy-miller-picked-for-city-council>.
- ^{xiii} Lucas Sullivan, *Columbus Councilman A. Troy Miller resigning*, Columbus Dispatch (Aug. 30, 2014), http://www.dispatch.com/content/stories/local/2014/08/29/Miller_resigning_council_seat.html.
- ^{xiv} *Columbus City Council: Hearcel F. Craig*, Columbus Dispatch (Oct. 3, 2007), <http://www.dispatch.com/article/20071003/NEWS/310039796>.
- ^{xv} Walker Evans, *City Council Election 2011: Interview with Andrew Ginther*, Columbus Underground (Oct. 20, 2011), <https://www.columbusunderground.com/city-council-election-2011-interview-with-andrew-ginther>.
- ^{xvi} Jeff Bell, *Councilman Boyce appointed state treasurer*, Bizjournals.com (Dec. 23, 2008), <https://www.bizjournals.com/columbus/stories/2008/12/22/daily12.html>.